

GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD



HPRB ACTIONS
July 28 and August 4, 2016

JULY 28 MEETING

The Historic Preservation Review Board met and considered the following items. Present: Gretchen Pfaehler (Chair), Andrew Aurbach, Brian Crane, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, and Joseph Taylor. Absent: Rauzia Ally, Charles Wilson.

DESIGNATION APPLICATIONS

Brookland Bowling Alley, 3726 10th Street NE, Case 09-08.

The Board designated the Brookland Bowling Alleys, 3726 10th Street NE, a historic landmark in the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites and requested that the nomination to be forwarded to the National Register of Historic Places. Vote: 6-0.

Fifteenth Street Financial Historic District amendment/expansion, Case 16-12.

The Board approved the amendment of the Fifteenth Street Financial Historic District designation as presented for listing in the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites and for forwarding to the National Register of Historic Places. The amendment includes 1) a boundary increase; 2) a name change to "Financial Historic District;" 3) an expanded Period of Significance; and 4) a more complete representation of the history and growth of the city's financial district. The Board also requested that a technical revision to be made to a boundary line, as discussed at the hearing, be officially noticed, and then submitted to the Board for its approval at near future HPRB meeting. Vote: 6-0.

B.F. Saul Building, 925 15th Street NW, Case 11-03.

The Board designated the B.F. Saul Building at 925 15th Street NW, a historic landmark in the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites and recommended forwarding the nomination to the National Register of Historic Places. Vote: 6-0.

Davidson Building, 927 15th Street/1432 K Street NW, Case 14-14.

The Board designated the Davidson Office Building at 927 15th Street NW a historic landmark in the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites and recommended forwarding the nomination to the National Register of Historic Places. Vote: 6-0.

KALORAMA TRIANGLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

2341 Ashmead Place NW, HPA 16-055, revised concept/rear and roof additions and front areaway

The Board found the rear addition and deck to be compatible with the Kalorama Triangle Historic District, but determined that a roof addition was not compatible. Final approval was delegated to staff. Vote: 6-0.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

300 8th Street NE, HPA 16-443, concept/construction of new residential building.

The Board found the concept for new construction to be not incompatible with the character of the historic district, contingent on the penthouse being eliminated on the three-story corner

element, that the brick not be painted, and that the proportions of the windows on C Street, the lighting plan, and the impact of construction on the adjoining buildings along the alley continue to be developed in consultation with HPO. Vote: 6-0.

1229 E Street and 1230 Pennsylvania Avenue SE, HPA 16-379, concept/reconstruction, relocation and addition to 1229 E; construction of five-story residential and retail building on Pennsylvania.

Given its condition and circumstances, the Board found the concept to document, dismantle, salvage, relocate and reconstruct the original portion of 1229 E Street, SE to be consistent with the purposes of the preservation act, and found the new construction on Pennsylvania Avenue to be compatible with the historic district. For the shotgun house addition, the Board asked the proportions of the fenestration continue to be refined and the height of the roof be lowered; for the new construction on Pennsylvania, the Board asked that the size of the penthouse be reduced to the greatest extent possible, and that the design of the garage door continue to be refined. It was recommended that the applicant work with HPO on evaluating the potential for archaeological resources on the site. Final approval was delegated to HPO. Vote: 6-0.

411 New Jersey Avenue, SE, HPA 16-521, concept/new construction.

The Board approved the concept as compatible with the historic district and delegated final approval to staff, contingent on further development of the third floor to better integrate it with the rest of the design, strengthening the prominence of the front door, standardizing the window sizes and types, limiting the visual impact of any roof equipment, and exploring the archaeological potential of the site. Vote: 6-0.

DUPONT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

2147-2149 P Street NW, HPA 16-528, concept/five-story addition behind three-story historic buildings.

The Board found the concept generally consistent with the historic district and consistent with the preservation act with the following conditions: (1) the addition should be shifted back off of the main block of each historic house—34' setback at 2147 and 54' setback at 2149—so that the addition will read convincingly as a separate building; (2) the 4 elevations should continue to be developed so they are a more cohesive; (3) the front doors should be aligned with 2nd and 3rd floor façade windows; 4) the project should return to the Board for further review when redesigned. Vote: 5-1.

2122 O Street NW, HPA 16-453, concept/rear and third-story addition and deck.

The Board approved the concept as generally compatible with the historic district and consistent with the preservation act and delegated final approval to staff with the following conditions: 1) that the permit contain a condition that the addition and roof deck railing shall not visible from O Street, to be first confirmed by a mock-up; 2) that the utility meters shall be located out of sight, perhaps under the porch; 3) that the side court at 2122 O Street should mirror the court at 2124 O Street in length and width; 4) that the basement steps do not become wider and more prominent; and 5) that the applicant restores any historic windows. Vote: 6-0 (Wilson recused).

AUGUST 4 MEETING

The Historic Preservation Review Board met and considered the following items. Present: Gretchen Pfaehler (Chair), Andrew Aurbach, Brian Crane, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Joseph Taylor, Charles Wilson. Absent: Rauzia Ally.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

507 8th Street SE, HPA 16-518, concept/two-story roof addition on two-story building.

The Board found the concept of adding a two-story addition of this size and visibility from the 8th Street SE right-of-way to be incompatible with the character of the historic district and advised the applicant to reduce the addition such that it will be smaller and less visible from the 8th Street SE right-of-way and return to the Board for further review. Vote: 7-0.

MOUNT PLEASANT HISTORIC DISTRICT

3109 18th Street NW, HPA 16-527, concept/roof addition.

The Board found the addition to detract from rather than enhance the subject property, was and incompatible with the character of the historic district and therefore inconsistent with the purposes of the preservation act. Specifically, the Board considered the presented options for a third story to be either incongruous or lending a false history to the building and row, adversely affecting its massing and the exposed character-defining secondary elevation and the pent-roof form typical of such rows. The Board also recommended against the installation of skylights in the front roof. The Board recommended that the applicant explore options to add behind the attic in a manner that would not be conspicuous from 18th Street. The Board acknowledged the Advisory Neighborhood Commission resolution in favor of the application, but disagreed with its contention that adversely altering the character of a single property is irrelevant to the question and standard of compatibility with the character of the historic district, and therefore to the purposes of the preservation law. Vote: 7-0.

MOUNT VERNON SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

416 Ridge Street NW, HPA 16-519, concept/new accessory building and side addition, two stories.

The Board found the concept for a rear & side addition and two-story accessory structure at 419 Ridge Street NW consistent with the purposes of the Act, compatible with the Mount Vernon Square Historic District, and delegated final approval to the staff. Vote: 7-0.

ANACOSTIA HISTORIC DISTRICT

~~1341 W Street SE, HPA 16-514, concept/subdivision, construction of two-story house.~~
(Case withdrawn by applicant)

WALTER REED ARMY MEDICAL CENTER HISTORIC DISTRICT

Informational Presentation: Proposed historic district design guidelines.

The Board recommended that there be a section on archaeology, to address archaeological work done thus far and any that might be necessary in the future. The Board urged more consideration great care to be given to the application of new materials and the relationship of their colors, modules, expanse and texture to the existing building fabric and among the new buildings and their parts. The Board expressed concern about the potential for unsightly storm-water retention features and the need to compatibly incorporate other sustainability features. The Board would also be concerned about conspicuous mechanical and electrical equipment around and atop buildings. The Board encouraged that there be more content on the subject of adding to, repairing and altering the historic buildings, as well as about the maintenance and replacement of plantings in the historic landscapes. The Board encouraged the retention of the sense of the historic base's boundary through the retention of historic fencing and even non-contributing fence piers. The Board also encouraged that some sense of the historic landscape be extended up into the redeveloped northern campus. Similarly, the Board encouraged employing the

flexibility recommended by the guidelines to vary the new buildings and have them evoke their relationship to the historic core of the campus.

CONSENT CALENDAR

The Board approved the following items on the consent calendar on July 28 by a vote of 7-0, with the comments and revisions noted below:

HISTORIC LANDMARK NOMINATION

Concord Apartments, 5805-5825 (odd numbers) 14th Street NW, Case 16-13.

The Board acknowledged the letter of support from the ANC, and voted to approve the designation.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

622-624 North Carolina Avenue SE, HPA 16-434, concept/rear and roof additions

The Board asked that the applicant and staff continue to work to see if the height of the elevator overrun, which will be visible from the east, can be further reduced in height, and to investigate the use of circular stairs in the rear to reduce the footprint.

626 E Street SE, HPA 16-450, concept/façade alterations to non-contributing apartment building

The Board approved the general concept of updating the building but questioned the use of ground-faced CMU block and the “stucco system” for the façade on the grounds that they would not age well; the Board asked that the applicant and staff work to identify alternative materials, and concurred with the community letters received that a landscape plan needed to be developed for the property.

4 4th Street SE, HPA 16-515, concept/oriel window, ramp in public space

The Board approved the general concept but did not approve the metal oriel bay in its current form and materials, and asked that the applicant work with staff on a more compatible proposal. The approval of the increase of paving on the 4th Street side needed to be off-set by removal of paving and vegetation provided on the East Capitol Street side.

DUPONT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

2012 P Street NW, HPA 16-525, concept/non-visible third-story addition.

The Board noted that the plans were very preliminary and approved the roof addition only on the condition that a flag test is performed that confirms that it will not be visible from street view.

SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

1336 8th Street NW, HPA 16-353, revised concept/new construction of ten-story retail and residential building

Transcripts of Historic Preservation Review Board Meetings may be purchased from the court reporting agency that covered this hearing – Olender Reporting, Inc. (202) 898-1108, www.olenderreporting.com, or info@OlenderReporting.com. Copies of individual staff reports that are prepared in advance of the hearing are posted on our website at <http://planning.dc.gov>